

Conflict-Sensitive Conservation

This book provides an empirically formulated foundation for conflict-sensitive conservation, a field in which the existing literature relies primarily on anecdotal evidence.

Seeking to better understand the impact of conflict on the implementation and outcomes of environmental projects, the Global Environment Facility (GEF) Independent Evaluation Office and the Environmental Law Institute undertook an evaluation of GEF support to fragile and conflict-affected contexts. Following a qualitative and quantitative analysis of documents from more than 4,000 projects, the research team discovered a statistically significant negative correlation between a country's Fragile States Index score and the implementation quality of environmental projects in that country. In this book, the evaluation and research team explain these groundbreaking findings in detail, highlighting seven key case studies: Afghanistan, Albertine Rift, Balkans, Cambodia, Colombia, Lebanon, and Mali. Drawing upon additional research and interviews with GEF project implementation staff, the volume illustrates the pathways through which conflict and fragility frequently impact environmental projects. It also examines how practitioners and sponsoring institutions can plan and implement their projects to avoid or mitigate these issues and find opportunities to promote peacebuilding through their environmental interventions.

Examining data from 164 countries and territories, this innovative book will be of great interest to students and scholars of environmental management, conservation, international development, and the fast-growing field of environmental peacebuilding. It will also be a great resource for practitioners working in these important fields.

Carl Bruch is Director of International Programs at the Environmental Law Institute and Founding President of the Environmental Peacebuilding Association. His work focuses on environmental peacebuilding (especially after conflict), environmental governance, adaptation, and environmental emergencies. He has helped dozens of countries—including many conflict-affected countries—around the world strengthen their environmental laws, institutions, and practices.

Geeta Batra is an evaluation and development professional with a passion for promoting environmental sustainability and accountability and learning with an open mind. She has 28 years of experience in international development across the World Bank Group, the Global Environment Facility (GEF), and the private sector. She has effectively managed global evaluation teams for 18 years to deliver more than 150 high-quality thematic evaluations, covering public and private sector investments and advisory work, with success in influencing organizational strategies and change. Geeta is currently Chief Evaluation Officer and Deputy Director with the Independent Evaluation Office of the GEF and leads the overall evaluation program covering thematic evaluations on climate change and other environmental areas, as well as institutional themes, such as governance, country strategies, private sector engagement, safeguard policies, gender, and inclusion. Prior to joining the GEF, she managed the program of country and corporate evaluations at the Independent Evaluation Group of the World Bank. Geeta established the results measurement practice and network at the International Finance Corporation (IFC), setting up the systems for self-evaluation and conducting impact and real-time evaluations, which influenced IFC strategies and programs. She has broad subject matter expertise in development and applied economics and evaluation approaches applicable to public and private sector interventions. She has published several books and articles, built capacity through training, and presented at a number of conferences and forums.

Anupam Anand is Senior Evaluation Officer at the Independent Evaluation Office of the GEF (GEF-IEO). He has over 15 years of experience in evaluation, international development, academic research, and teaching. At the GEF-IEO, he has led evaluations on biodiversity, SFM and REDD+, land degradation, fragility and conflict, and illegal wildlife trade. Anupam holds a Ph.D. in applied remote sensing from the University of Maryland.

Shehla Chowdhury worked for two years as a research associate at the Environmental Law Institute. There, she researched topics including monitoring and evaluation practices for environmental peacebuilding, legal frameworks for mitigating the “green resource curse” in Africa, and local government environmental compliance in the U.S. Shehla is now a J.D. candidate at Yale Law School, studying the intersection of international, environmental, and human rights law.

Sierra Killian is a former research associate at the Environmental Law Institute. While at ELI, she coordinated the environmental peacebuilding program, researched small-scale fisheries management and marine protected area policies, and helped to build the organization’s climate resilience work. She holds a B.S. in Earth systems from Stanford University and is pursuing her J.D. at the University of California, Berkeley, School of Law.

Conflict-Sensitive Conservation

Lessons from the Global Environment Facility

Carl Bruch, Geeta Batra, and Anupam Anand

with Shehla Chowdhury and Sierra Killian



Routledge

Taylor & Francis Group

LONDON AND NEW YORK

earthscan
from Routledge

Designed cover image: shutterstock_1029171697

First published 2024

by Routledge

4 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

and by Routledge

605 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10158

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

© 2024 Carl Bruch, Geeta Batra, Anupam Anand, Shehla Chowdhury and Sierra Killian

The right of Carl Bruch, Geeta Batra, Anupam Anand, Shehla Chowdhury and Sierra Killian to be identified as authors of this work has been asserted in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

The Open Access version of this book, available at www.taylorfrancis.com, has been made available under a Creative Commons Attribution-Non Commercial-No Derivatives 4.0 license. Funded by The Independent Evaluation Office of the Global Environment Facility.

Trademark notice: Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN: 978-1-032-39794-8 (hbk)

ISBN: 978-1-032-39795-5 (pbk)

ISBN: 978-1-003-35139-9 (ebk)

DOI: 10.4324/9781003351399

Typeset in Times New Roman

by Apex CoVantage, LLC

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	vii
<i>List of Acronyms and Abbreviations</i>	ix
<i>Foreword</i>	xii
Part I: GEF Programming in Fragile and Conflict-Affected Situations	1
1 Introduction	3
2 GEF Support in Fragile and Conflict-Affected Situations	27
3 Findings: Analysis of GEF Support in Conflict-Affected Situations	63
4 Conflict-Sensitive Programming in the GEF	86
5 Conflict-Sensitive Programming Across the Project Life Cycle: Design, Implementation, and Completion	110
Part II: Situation Case Studies	137
6 Africa: Mali and the Albertine Rift	139
7 Asia: Afghanistan and Cambodia	161

vi *Contents*

8 Latin America: Colombia	177
9 The Mediterranean Region: Lebanon and the Balkans	189
Part III: Lessons and Recommendations	211
10 Conclusions and Way Forward	213
<i>Index</i>	222

Acknowledgements

The case study chapters in this book draw upon situation profiles prepared by the Environmental Law Institute. We gratefully acknowledge the primary authors of the situation profiles: Julia Monsarrat (Mali); Rollin Bresson (Albertine Rift); Elizabeth Hessami and Andrew Blunt (Afghanistan); Matt Gallagher and Anna Kasradze (Cambodia); Alexandra Caplan (Lebanon); Ljubica Nikolic, Bay Hanson, and Chiara Maero (The Balkans); and Giovanni Galli (Colombia). Providing research, drafting, and editing assistance were Elsa Barron, Amber Bosse, Alex Boyce, Rollin Bresson, Wenzhu (Alice) Chen, Helene Combes, Heather Croshaw, Miriam Dargasuk, Desirée De Haven, Adrienne Derstein, Claire Doyle, Scott Drinkall, Anthony D’Souza, Flavia Eichmann, Marisa Ensor, Emma Gillies, Tristana Giunta, Nina Hamilton, Ellen Johnson, Elena Kochnowicz, Avital Li, Marie Mavrikios, Amanda Mei, Jasmine Muñoz, Alex Page, Anna Rossi, Gandhi Signe, Rachel Stern, Rachel Stromsta, Well Witoonchart, and Junjun Zhou. Malac Kabir of the GEF Independent Evaluation Office provided support.

We are also grateful to the staff and experts who generously shared their time and thoughts that informed this book, including Maya Abboud (Lebanese Agricultural Research Institute), Paola Agostini (World Bank), Guy Alaerts (World Bank), Osama al-Nouri (BirdLife Lebanon), Ali Azimi (Asian Development Bank), John Barrett (African Parks), Mujtaba Bashari (Wildlife Conservation Society), Alexander Belyakov (Secretariat of the Convention on Biological Diversity), Christophe Besacier (FAO), Yue Cao (ODI), Carla de Chassy (SEEP Network), Roshan Cooke (IFAD), Alec Crawford (IISD), Christophe Crépin (World Bank), Raduska Cupac (UNDP), Richard Damania (World Bank), Dusan Dobricic (Serbian Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Water Management), Amina Gabela (Forestry and Environmental Action), Hazima Hadzovic (Bosnian Federal Ministry of Agriculture, Water Management and Forestry), Anne Hammill (IISD), Steffen Hansen (GEF), Garobed Haroutunian (UNDP), Tracy Hart (World Bank), Juergen Hierold (UNIDO), Astrid Hillers (GEF), Naftali Honig (African Parks), Fareeha Iqbal (GEF), Mikio Ishiwatari (Japan International Cooperation Agency), Olivera Jordanovic (World Bank), Amer Kavazovic (Sava River Basin District Agency), Charles Kelly (Independent Consultant), Bosko Kenjic (Bosnian Ministry of Foreign Trade and Economic Relations), Katya Kuang-Idba (GEF), Olivia Lazard (European Institute of Peace), Liza Leclerc (IFAD), Julia LeMense (Legal and Disaster Management Consulting), Heng Liu (UNIDO),

Nikola Maravic (Serbian Ministry of Environmental Protection), Bancy Mati (Jomo Kenyatta University of Agriculture and Technology), Kisa Mfalila (IFAD), Darko Milutin (World Bank), Héctor Camilo Morales (Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin), Nathan Morrow (Tulane University), Maryam Niamir-Fuller (UNEP), Senad Oprasic (Bosnian Ministry of Trade and Economic Relations), Juan Pablo Ruiz (World Bank), Jimena Puyana (UNDP), Qais Sahar (Wildlife Conservation Society), Jihan Seoud (UNDP), Karan Sehgal (FAO), Assad Serhal (Society for the Protection of Nature in Lebanon), Mirko Serkovic (World Bank), Garry Shea (Wildlife Conservation Society), Penny Stock (UNDP), Mirko Ivo Serkovic (World Bank), Ada Sonnenfeld (International Initiative for Impact Evaluation), Amanda Woomer (EnPAX), Sarah Wyatt (GEF), and Mark Zimsky (GEF).

The views (and any errors) expressed in this book are those of the authors alone. They do not represent the views of their respective institutional affiliations.

Acronyms and Abbreviations

Abbreviation or Acronym	Meaning
ABNJ	area beyond national jurisdiction
ACATISEMA	Asociación de Cabildos y Autoridades Tradicionales Indígenas de la Selva de Matavén
ADB	Asian Development Bank
AfDB	African Development Bank
AFOLU	agriculture and forestry
BACRIM	criminal gangs
BBC	British Broadcasting Corporation
CALM	Conservation Areas Landscape Management
CAU	United Self-Defense Forces of Colombia
CBD	Convention on Biological Diversity
CBSP	Congo Basin Strategic Program
CEO	Chief Executive Officer
CI	Conservation International
CIPAV	Center for Research on Sustainable Agricultural Production Systems
CITES	Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora
CNA	Center for Naval Analyses Corporation
COAMA	Consolidation of the Colombian Amazon
COPs	Conferences of the Parties
CRFA	County Resilience and Fragility Assessment
CTCN	Climate Technology Centre and Network
DBSA	Development Bank of Southern Africa
DBSB	Danube/Black Sea and Mediterranean Basin
DfID	UK Department for International Development
DRB	Drina River Basin
DRC	Democratic Republic of the Congo
EBRD	European Bank for Reconstruction and Development
EC DEVCO	European Commission's Directorate-General for

	International Cooperation and Development
ELI	Environmental Law Institute
ELN	National Liberation Army
EU	European Union
EXPAN	Expanding the Protected Area Network
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
FARC	Revolutionary Armed Forces of Colombia
FEDEGAN	cattle ranchers' association
GEF	Global Environment Facility
GEF IEO	Global Environment Facility Independent Evaluation Office
GEF STAP	Global Environment Facility Scientific and Technology Advisory Panel
IDB	Inter-American Development Bank
IDEAM	Hidrología, Meteorología y Estudios Ambientales (meteorological institute)
IEO	Independent Evaluation Office
IFAD	International Fund for Agricultural Development
IGCP	International Gorilla Conservation Program
IMF	International Monetary Fund
INS	Instituto Nacional de Salud (National Institute of Health)
INVEMAR	Instituto de Investigaciones Marinas y Costeras
IP	indigenous peoples
IPCC	International Panel on Climate Change
ISIL	Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant
ITTO	International Tropical Timber Organization
IUCN	World Conservation Union
LDN	Land Degradation Neutrality
M&E	monitoring and evaluation
MADR	Colombian National Ministry for Agriculture
MADS	Colombian National Ministry of the Environment
MAP	medicinal and aromatic plant
MEA	Multilateral Environmental Agreements
MOE	Ministry of Environment
MOOC	massive open online course
MRC	Mekong River Commission
MSB	migratory soaring bird
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NGO	nongovernmental organization
NPR	National Public Radio
NRSP	Nigeria Stability and Reconciliation Programme
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development

OECD DAC	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, Development Assistant Committee
OHCHR	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
PCB	polychlorinated biphenyl
PMIS	Project Management Information System
POP	persistent organic pollutant
PRIO	Peace Research Institute Oslo
RET	renewable energy technologies
SDGs	Sustainable Development Goals
SIP	Strategic Investment Program
SPWA-CC	Strategic Programme for West Africa—Climate Change
S-RET	Scaling-up of Renewable Energy Technologies
STAP	Scientific and Technology Advisory Panel
TAMP	Transboundary Agro-Ecosystem Management Programme
TER	terminal evaluation review
TSBR	Tonle Sap Biosphere Reserve
UAESPNN	Unidad Administrativa Especial del Sistema de Parques Nacionales Naturales (national natural parks system administration)
UN	United Nations
UN OCHA	United Nations Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs
UNCCD	United Nations Convention of Combat Desertification
UNDESA	United Nations Department of Social and Economic Affairs
UNDG	United Nations Development Group
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNEP	United Nations Environment Programme
UNFCCC	United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
UNFPA	United Nations Interagency Framework Team for Preventive Action
UNHCR	United Nations High Commission for Refugees
UNICEF	United Nations Children’s Fund
UNIDO	United Nations Industrial Development Organization
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
VNP	Virachey National Park
WWF	World Wildlife Fund

Foreword

The timeliness of this book can hardly be overstated. It brings together two issues that I would call the defining challenges of our time. On one hand, there is climate change and the degradation of natural resources and the environment. On the other, there is fragility, conflict, and vulnerability. As you read the book, it becomes crystal clear how these are closely intertwined.

The international development scene has changed dramatically over the past few decades. A few short decades ago, there was general optimism regarding social and economic development that would eventually lift all countries and their citizens out of poverty. This optimism, at least in the West, was at its highest in the 1990s following the end of the Cold War, when some observers predicted a final victory for global capitalism. Poverty was being reduced at rapid rates and would be relegated to history during our lifetime. While some voices warned about the loss of biodiversity and concern over global warming was increasing, we had reason for optimism on that front too. The 1992 Earth Summit in Rio de Janeiro was the largest gathering ever of heads of state and government, and it led to concrete agreements among countries to tackle the most pressing environmental problems jointly. Major multilateral environmental agreements—including the Convention on Biodiversity, the UN Convention to Combat Desertification, and the UN Framework Convention on Climate Change—were agreed upon, and countries in the Global North committed to financing sustainable development in the Global South. The Global Environment Facility (GEF) was established in this spirit.

Fast forward to today, and the picture looks very different. Environmental degradation has assumed unforeseen proportions. Deforestation continues at stubbornly high rates, and more species and ecosystems are lost forever than ever before during human existence. Land degradation threatens vast swathes of land, putting people's livelihoods and food security at risk, exacerbated by runaway climate change. Climate change is no longer a theoretical prospect but is touching all our lives with prolonged droughts and heat waves, stronger and more frequent storms, and sea-level rise that is particularly dangerous for island nations and low-lying coastal areas, where settlements and economic activity have increasingly concentrated. Despite high-level political declarations and accords, such as the Paris Climate Agreement, concrete actions to counter climate change have been slow to materialize.

Poverty has been reduced proportionally, thanks largely to rapid and relatively equitable growth in China. A number of other countries have also risen to upper-middle income status, such as Brazil, Côte d'Ivoire, Mexico, South Africa, and Thailand (World Population Review, n.d.). Still, in all of them, poverty remains a major challenge, and the gap between the rich and the poor has widened. This same phenomenon can be seen equally in many rich countries, not least the United States. Globally, the United Nations estimates that there are today more than 1.2 billion people living in acute multidimensional poverty (United Nations Development Programme & Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative, 2022), a number that increased significantly due to the pandemic and has been exacerbated by Russia's war in Ukraine.

Notably, there is a large group of countries where the quality of life has not improved over these decades. Many of these countries are facing conflict and fragility. The World Bank classifies such countries based on two criteria: (a) countries with high levels of institutional and social fragility and (b) countries affected by violent conflict (World Bank, n.d.). Today, 20 and 17 countries, respectively, fall into these categories. Needless to say, countries may move in and out of these situations based on their trajectories and specific events. These situations lead to human suffering that often has the worst effects on women and children. Conflict and fragility are also related to population displacements that may further worsen tensions.

There is a clear correlation between conflict and the environment, and it cuts both ways. Conflict is often a major cause of environmental destruction. Wars especially are highly destructive for both the human and the natural environments, but even lower level conflicts can be quite detrimental in environmental terms. However, the list of countries in fragile and conflict-affected situations reveals the unquestionable effects of climate change and environmental degradation. Many of the countries are experiencing droughts affecting food security and societal stability. A specific category of vulnerability pertains to small island developing states that face existential threats from climate-related hazards. There is a demonstrable effect that climate change and degradation of natural resources has on peace and stability. Although interstate wars have not been fought over environmental resources, intrastate conflict and tensions between different groups increase. Meta-analysis of studies has confirmed that, statistically, conflict risk increases with temperature and precipitation deviating from the average (Hsiang et al., 2013). Climatic hazards affect societies and people unevenly, hurting worst those who are the most vulnerable. Research shows how the most severe humanitarian crises take place in countries that are exposed both to violent conflict and climate-related shocks. Such countries may find it hard to escape the vicious cycle (Buhaug & von Uexkull, 2021).

This book homes in on these connections through concrete case studies and lessons from the field. The research for the book was conducted as part of a major evaluation of GEF-funded programs and projects. It was the first of its kind, taking a systematic look at how environmental interventions interact with and are affected by fragility and conflict. The need for the evaluation became evident,

as performance data for GEF-funded activities revealed differences in outcome achievement depending on region and country type. An early analysis showed that the facility has over the years funded thousands of interventions in fragile and/or conflict-affected situations.

The authors from the GEF Independent Evaluation Office and the Environmental Law Institute were also the evaluators who brought together a unique combination of knowledge, experience, and skills, covering expertise in climate change and the environment, international development, peacebuilding and conflict resolution, and quantitative and qualitative research and evaluation approaches. The result was a powerful and pathbreaking study that influenced policymaking in international environment and development finance. This book expands on the topic and brings the results of the research to bear on this increasingly important field more broadly.

The lessons outlined in this book are both concrete and profound. They identify specific pathways through which fragility and conflict affect sustainable development and interventions that focus on the environment. The book offers recommendations on how international development and environment agencies, be they public, private, or nongovernmental, can enhance their policies, programs, and projects to deal with fragile and conflict-affected situations. The authors have even identified cases where such situations may open up opportunities for cooperation. The bottom line, however, is that context matters, and anyone wanting to make a durable impact on the environment and people's lives must pay close attention to the situation on the ground. This includes the political, economic, social, cultural, and security situation and the state of the environment and natural resources. Any successful strategy or intervention must understand the drivers of environmental change and development on the ground.

This is the perspective of the book. It is both thoroughly informed by experiences in fragile and conflict-affected situations and strongly anchored in theoretical understanding. It builds upon evaluative evidence from the ground up and dives deep into real-life situations. It embodies knowledge and wisdom that is sorely needed in these times of uncertainty.

Juha I. Uitto, Ph.D.
Director, Independent Evaluation Office
Global Environment Facility

References

- Buhaug, H., & von Uexkull, N. (2021). Vicious circles: Violence, vulnerability, and climate change. *Annual Review of Environment and Resources*, 46, 545–568. <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-environ-012220-014708>
- Hsiang, S., Burke, M., & Miguel, E. (2013). Quantifying the influence of climate on human conflict. *Science*, 341(6151), 1235267. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1235367>
- United Nations Development Programme & Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative. (2022). *2022 Global multidimensional poverty index (MPI): Unpacking deprivation bundles to reduce multidimensional poverty*. <https://hdr.undp.org/content/2022-global-multidimensional-poverty-index-mpi#/indicies/MPI>

World Bank. (n.d.). *Classification of fragile and conflict-affected situations*. Retrieved January 3, 2023, from <https://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/fragilityconflictviolence/brief/harmonized-list-of-fragile-situations>

World Population Review. (n.d.). *Middle-income countries*. Retrieved January 3, 2023, from <https://worldpopulationreview.com/country-rankings/middle-income-countries>

